



**Independent Evaluation of Environmental and Social Safeguards
Bhutan for Life Project**

2022

1. Executive Summary

The purpose of the independent evaluation is to provide the Board, BFL Fund Secretariat Project Coordination Unit and GCF Accredited Entity with insights regarding the extent to which the PAs, BCs, and other Implementing Agencies have integrated the existing safeguards and sustainability policies into their project activities to address and control Environment and Social risks. It also assesses the effectiveness of the policies and procedures in practice and presents the outcomes achieved. The following are the summaries of key findings:

Key Findings

- During the reporting period, the implementation of the Environment and Social Safeguards (ESS) process and procedures has demonstrated efficiency and effectiveness. A total of 58 activities, covering 10 PAs, 8 BCs, and an OGOP project, have prepared ESS mitigation plans. Only 3 activities were deferred, and 1 activity got dropped.
- Over the years, there has been a noticeable improvement in the capacity of forest officials, enabling them to effectively identify ESS mitigation requirements, prepare plans, and implement ESS mitigation activities. However, the frequent transfer of staff poses a challenge to sustaining this capacity enhancement. Therefore, it is crucial to continuously invest in capacity building efforts to ensure ongoing skill development among forest officials.
- Significant efforts have been undertaken to enhance and improve the implementation, compliance, and reporting of ESS measures. Nevertheless, there remain certain issues, challenges, and gaps pertaining to the ESS process, procedures, and the implementation of safeguards.
- Certain activities that underwent ESS screening and mitigation measures were observed to be relatively small in scale and budget. Furthermore, the on-site assessment validates that these activities pose low risks to the environment and the local population in their vicinity.
- There were no grievances reported in 2022. Based on the survey conducted among PAs and BCs, it was found that only 1 out of 13 respondents conducted GRM sensitization, while the remaining respondents have plans to conduct it in 2023. However, GRM brochures in English were distributed to local government offices. The lack of community awareness and the laid-back nature of the Bhutanese could potentially attribute the absence of grievance reports in 2022 and previous years.
- All ESS mitigation measures adhered to the national laws and regulations concerning environmental and social safeguards.

2. Introduction

2.1 Background information on the BFL

The Bhutan for Life (BFL) project will secure 51 percent of the nation's territory as managed under its network of Protected Areas (PAs), and serves as the cornerstone of Bhutan's bold pledge to remain carbon neutral, as re-stated in its Nationally Determined Contribution (NDC) under the Paris Agreement. It is also central to the country's plans for meeting its constitutional requirement to maintain a minimum of 60 percent of its land area under forest cover

Bhutan for Life is a 14-year financial bridge that allows for immediate improvement in the management of Bhutan's protected areas for climate resilience, and the prompt delivery of mitigation, adaptation and biodiversity gains, while the country gradually ratchets up its own financing resources. The project will accomplish this objective through the implementation the below components:

Component A: Mitigation: Increasing forestry and land use climate mitigation This component focuses on monitoring systems that detect forest cover change and ecological responses of forests and other systems to impacts of climate change. The findings will be used to develop climate resilient forest management practices and restoration of the degraded lands to conserve and enhance carbon stock.

Component B: Adaptation I: Integrated adaptation in communities and ecosystems to improve natural resource management for livelihoods and climate resilience This component focuses on harnessing climate, hydrological, and natural resources information to design and implement resilience and adaptation measures in Bhutan's protected areas (PAs). This component will work to benefit nature and the livelihood of the population living both inside and in the vicinity of the PAs.

Component C: Adaptation II: Climate-smart conservation to enhance provision of ecosystem services This component focuses on harnessing climate, natural resource and biological information to design and implement ecosystem-based adaptation management of Bhutan's PAs. This component will work to secure wildlife, habitat, and reduce human wildlife conflict in the changing climate while ensuring the sustainable flow of ecosystem services.

Component D: Protected areas: Effective management of protected areas This component focuses on strengthening the organizational, institutional and resource capacity for effective management of PAs. This is a crucial component, as the success of the initiative is dependent on fully equipped, well trained staff; full funding; essential infrastructure; and a well-organized system for managing the protected areas.

Component E: BFL program management: Management, monitoring, reporting & evaluation, policy support, contingencies This component groups all the management activities necessary for the effective implementation of BFL. As such, its purpose is to ensure the efficient implementation of the BFL program.

2.2 Purpose of the evaluation

The assignment was conducted to assess the efficiency and effectiveness of the Environment and Social Safeguards (ESS) implementation in the field by PAs/BCs for the year 2022.

The evaluation covered the following aspects:

- Review of ESS screening tools
- Review of compliance monitoring plan and report
- Implementation strategies
- Benefits of ESS interventions on affected communities
- Benefits of ESS interventions on the local environment
- Challenges and gaps encountered during the ESS implementation in the field

Based on the assessments, the consultant will provide appropriate recommendations.

2.3 Objective of the evaluation

The objectives of the evaluation are as follows:

- To assess the effectiveness of the environmental and social safeguard interventions implemented by the PAs and BCs.
- To identify strengths and weaknesses in the implementation of the environmental and social safeguard procedures.
- To provide recommendations for improving the implementation of the environmental and social safeguard procedures.
- To assess the capacity of the implementing agencies and stakeholders to implement and monitor the environmental and social safeguard procedures.
- **To develop specific GRM brochures for PAs and BCs.**

2.4 Scope and Methodology

The evaluation covered the period of January to December 2022 and will focus on the following key areas:

- Compliance with national laws and regulations related to environmental and social safeguards.
- Effectiveness of environmental and social safeguard policies and procedures in identifying and mitigating potential environmental and social impacts.

- Adequacy of the consultation and engagement process with stakeholders, particularly affected communities.
- Adequacy of the monitoring and reporting mechanisms for environmental and social safeguard impacts.

The methodology for the evaluation included

- *Inception meeting with BFLFS officials*

During the presentation of the inception report, the consultant and BFLFS staff engaged in a discussion regarding the methodology, potential field visit locations, the progress made, as well as the issues and challenges encountered in implementing the ESS. A list of documents to be referenced and other logistical matters relevant to the evaluation of the ESS were also discussed.

- *Review of project documents*

The consultant thoroughly reviewed the essential documents required to gather data and information for the evaluation of ESS compliance of BFL projects. These documents include ESMP 2022, Quarterly ESS compliance report for 2022, Annual report for 2022, Independent Evaluation Report for 2022, ESS screening conducted in 2022, Annual work plan and budget for 2022, Public consultation reports for 2022, Training reports for 2022, Occupational Health and Safety (OHS) Guidelines, WWF Safeguard Policy, and The Grievance Redressal Mechanism for the Bhutan for Life Program.

- *Interview of key informants*

The consultant had meetings with several key informants to discuss the implementation of ESS for the year 2022, its benefits, as well as any issues and challenges associated with it. The key informants included officials from BFLFS, PCU, BFL focal of PAs and BCs, Forest field staff of Khotokha, Phobjikha, Nobding and Paro, Forest staff of Divisional Forest Office in Wangdue Phodrang, Project beneficiaries in Khotokha and Phobjikha.

- *Assessment of capacity of PAs/BCs in ESS management*

A survey was conducted to assess the capacity of BFL focal points in PAs and BCs. The survey included questions regarding the number of capacity building opportunities availed by the BFL focal at Implementing Agency (IA), their comprehension of ESS, their level of confidence in managing ESS, and their identified capacity needs.

- *Data review and analysis*

The evaluation of BFL's ESS involved a thorough data review and analysis process. This process encompassed a comprehensive examination of relevant documents, including compliance reports, evaluation reports, and various other sources of information. A thorough

assessment was conducted to gauge the effectiveness of ESS in BFL projects, as well as to identify challenges and potential areas for improvement. The findings obtained from the data analysis were compiled to create the comprehensive evaluation report, which offers insights and recommendations for enhancing the ESS implementation of BFL projects.

- *Reporting*

Based on the findings comprehended by the consultant, a final ESS evaluation report has been compiled.

3. Compliance Evaluation Findings

3.1 Environment and Social Management Plan for 2022

3.1.1 Observation:

The Environmental and Social Management Plan (ESMP) for Bhutan for Life (BFL) is a comprehensive document that fulfills the requirements of WWF's Social Safeguards Integrated Policies and Procedures (SIPP). The BFL focal in the PAs/BCs and the ESS focal at the PCU have successfully identified all activities necessitating an ESMP. Mitigation measures have been developed based on this identification.

The ESMP contains detailed information about its scope and purpose, a list of planned activities with their implementation timeline, budget, monitoring and reporting schedules, and a set of mitigation measures for addressing environmental and social impacts. Its preparation involved extensive consultations with communities and stakeholders, gathering input from domain experts, and conducting field verifications. The ESMP has been approved by the WWF's Environmental and Social Safeguards specialist.

This site-specific plan can be readily implemented by the project focal and field officers. For the year 2022, the ESMP has been prepared for all 10 Protected Areas, 8 Biological Corridors, and the OGOP Project.

List of activities in the ESMP in 2022 that required mitigation measures:

Name of PA/BC	Number of activities with ESS mitigation measures
BWS	6 activities – 2 activities deffered
JDNP	3 activities
JKSNR	3 activities
JSWNP	3 activities
JWS	1 activity
PNP	5 activities
PWS	3 activities
RMNP	3 activities
SWS	2 activities
WCNP	2 activities
Total	31 activities
BC1	2 activities
BC2	7 activities
BC3	1 activity – 1 activity deffered
BC4	4 activities
BC5	2 activities
BC6	3 activities

BC7	2 activities
BC8	5 activities – 1 activity dropped
Total	26 activities
OGOP	1 activity
Total	1 activity
TOTAL	58 ACTIVITIES

Out of 58 planned ESS activities, 3 got deferred (2 activities under BWS, 1 under BC2) and 1 activity under BC8 got dropped.

3.1.2 Comments:

The ESMP for the year 2022 adhered to the guidelines and was well-prepared. However, there are a few observations that need to be highlighted based on information collected by the consultant through field visits, surveys, and telephonic conversations with the BFL focal and field officers:

- i. Some activities are relatively small in terms of both the size of the work and the budget allocation, making them unsuitable for undergoing the ESMP process. Examples of such small activities include the construction of a water tank post in BC1 (Nu.60,000) and the construction of a parking space in BC2 (Nu. 100,000)
- ii. The ESMP process necessitates multiple consultations, and in the absence of a dedicated budget for such activity, field offices face difficulties in carrying out the process.
- iii. Certain activities are recurring with the same mitigation measures being planned in the ESMP. In such cases, it may not be necessary to include these activities in the ESMP. For instance, the grassland management in PWS and RMNP.

The Independent Evaluation of ESS Report 2021 highlighted that the process of preparing the ESMP is lengthy and recommended that it should be shortened. The 2022 evaluation also identified the lengthy and cumbersome nature of the ESMP preparation process. This is likely due to the involvement of numerous stakeholders, including the community, field officers, BFL focal at IA, PCU, and the AE-WWF ESS specialist. To expedite the finalization of the ESMP, it is suggested that the ESS focal in the PCU and field offices, who have gained valuable experience over the years, take the lead in the preparation process. If necessary, BFLFS can provide insights and inputs during the process.

The involvement of the AE-WWF's ESS specialist in the preparation of ESMP was a good practice as the concept of ESS was relatively new to the Bhutanese. Throughout the years, the AE-WWF's ESS specialist has helped enhance the capabilities of Bhutanese officials, resulting in a noticeable level of confidence among the ESS focal at PCU and BFL focal in PAs/BCs when managing the ESS component and preparing ESMP. Given the confidence exhibited by Bhutanese officials, it is advisable to assign the responsibility of preparing and approving ESMP

to the ESS focal at PCU and finally endorsed by AE-WWF. If any difficulties arise, the ESS focal at PCU can seek assistance from the AE-WWF's ESS specialist, and the BFLFS is also available to provide support as needed.

3.1.3 Recommendations:

- Based on observations and findings from the last two evaluation reports, and also from the current evaluation, it has been observed that the approval process for ESMP is lengthy and cumbersome process. In light of this, it is recommended that the BFL focal at IA takes on the responsibility of conducting ESS screening and preparing the ESMP. Subsequently, the ESMP can be reviewed and approved by the ESS specialist at the PCU. Once approved, the ESMP can be shared with the AE-WWF for their information and endorsement, thus streamlining the approval process and facilitating efficient implementation of ESS measures.
- Given that the BFL project has entered its fifth year, many of the activities being carried out are similar to those of previous years. Consequently, the mitigation plan for ESS is likely to remain largely unchanged on an annual basis. With this understanding, the PCU should work with AE-WWF to reduce time in the preparation of ESS mitigation plan.
- Considering the scale and budget of the activities, it may not be necessary to develop individual ESS plans for every BFL funded activity. Instead, it is recommended that the PCU and the respective PAs and BCs collaborate to identify activities of a similar nature and develop consolidated ESS plans. By grouping these activities together, resources can be optimized, and the ESS planning process can be more efficient and effective.
- Considering the nature of certain activities, it may not be necessary to conduct ESS screening for all of them. For instance, the construction of a parking space for the eco-camp in Phobjikha may not warrant ESS screening due to the limited extent of excavation work involved and the minimal risk of worker injury. PCU should work with BFL focal at IA to categorize activities that would require ESS mitigation plan.
- In order to resolve the funding challenge related to community consultation for the ESMP, it is recommended that all PAs and BCs must incorporate budget for community consultation within their annual budget plan, specifically in the fourth quarter.

3.2 Implementation of ESS mitigation plans and compliance reporting

3.2.1 Observations

The Environment and Social Safeguards evaluation report for 2022 is based on the compliance report received from the field, site visits, survey questionnaire and virtual communications with the BFL focal officers and other forest officials. Among the PAs, out of 31 activities, 2 activities under BWS got deferred due to COVID related implications. Under the BCs, out of 26 activities, the only activity for BC3 got deferred to 2023 and another one got dropped due to internal issues. Under the OGOP category, one 1 activity with ESS requirements which got implemented. The ESS implementation is being carried out as a team work in most of the PAs and BCs, and as a result, no major issue has been reported.

The details of activity report and its compliance evidences are as follows:

Bumdeling Wildlife Sanctuary

Activity	ESS Plans	ESS compliance	Issues	Remarks
Eco-tourism development from Aja to Sheridong - Develop additional amenities.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Proper waste management and segregation • Workers health and safety • Control of contamination of local water sources 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Individual waste bins installed and disposed as per agreement signed between Mongar Dzongkhag, BWS and Contractor • The workers have been provided with safety gears by the contractor as per the bidding document • Proper toilet constructed and installed waste bins at the site to avoid water pollution 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Maintenance of proper hygiene of toilets and segregation of waste at the site 	<p>Regular cleaning of toilets and ongoing monitoring would be necessary to ensure timely maintenance.</p> <p>Promote the practice of waste segregation among employees.</p>
<i>Bio-engineering works at Dungtsho lake</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reduce disturbance of natural habitat • Reduce water contamination as a result of construction • Workers health and safety 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Ensured minimum disturbance to natural habitat, no machineries and even avoided making loud noise • Proper toilet and installed waste bins at the site • Contractor and workers were instructed to use safety gears as per the work order 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Difficult to clean surface area of lake • Inadequate safety gears for all workers 	<p>The contractor should devise innovative approaches for cleaning the lake's surface.</p> <p>In future projects, it is advisable for the client and contractor to allocate a budget for a sufficient quantity of safety equipment.</p>

Activity	ESS Plans	ESS compliance	Issues	Remarks
Develop basic structure like fencing, entrance gate and foot path for recreational site	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Proper waste management and segregation • Workers health and safety 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Individual waste bins installed and disposed as per agreement signed between BWS and community contractor • The workers have been provided with safety gears by the contractor as per the bidding document 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Frequency of waste collected by construction workers is very minimal and need to remind all workers during monitoring • Lack of enough safety gears to workers by contractor 	<p>Regular awareness campaigns on waste management and monitoring should be implemented.</p> <p>The contractor has the responsibility to procure any additional safety equipment as outlined in the contractual agreement, and the BFL focal at IA should oversee the monitoring process.</p>
Ecotourism Infrastructure development from Tsaling to Kharchendra Ney	Activity deferred	Activity deferred	The activity is deferred as per the discussion with PCU	The IA should ensure that the activities are implemented in 2023
Construction of Range Office	Activity deferred	Activity deferred	The activity is deferred as per the discussion with PCU	The IA should ensure that the activities are implemented in 2023

Jigme Khesar Strict Nature Reserve

Activity	ESS Plans	ESS compliance	Issues	Remarks
Construction of 3 wooden cantilever bridges	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Ensure careful setting, alignment, design of rig sites, and/or timing of works (seasonal) • Ensure soil excavation is carried out with minimal impact to natural habitats • Proper containers/waste bins should be provided at the project site • Dumping of waste in the 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Construction drawing and design were developed as per BSR of Engineering, and works are executed during favorable season. • Manual excavation as per the engineering design • Contractors were instructed to construct separate garbage pits at the site. • Contractors were instructed to segregate and dispose the bio- 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Local contractors face difficulty in understanding the drawings and design. • Waste collected were left at the construction sites (observed by PCU team) 	<p>The responsibility of identifying the appropriate contractor for the task lies with the IA.</p> <p>The IA should engage in ongoing monitoring throughout the project execution</p>

Activity	ESS Plans	ESS compliance	Issues	Remarks
	<p>river, in its vicinity, or in other non-designated places should be strictly prohibited</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Collection, transportation and final disposal of all waste should be carried out on a daily basis and not left in the river areas • Prohibit burning of construction waste. • Avoid pouring construction materials into the river • Comply with the workers' health and safety guidelines • Access to health facilities for the workers • Ensure that no underage workers, or children are engaged • Ensure conducive working environment, including an appropriate salary, working hours and accommodation shall be provided to all workers 	<p>degradable & non-degradable waste and bring back to Haa for further disposal</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Contractors are instructed to collect all the waste generated through construction work and dispose at landfill site, Haa • Construction waste (non-degradable) were segregated and transported back to Haa. • Proper waste segregation were made and dumped in designated pits • Workers were issued with safety gears by the contractor and followed the OHS protocols as and when required. Workers were made to work from 9:00 Am-4:30 PM daily • Workers and contractors were encouraged to visit the nearest health centre as an when they got sick • Contractors were instructed to deploy only the workers above age of 18 years to avoid future complications • All the workers were paid as per the prevailing rate (local construction rate), and stationed 		

Activity	ESS Plans	ESS compliance	Issues	Remarks
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Implement a grievance mechanism for workers (and their organizations, where they exist) to raise workplace concerns • Ensure that downstream communities are informed regarding planned project activities and these activities are designed in consultation with the communities 	<p>in a herding camp for accommodation</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Workers and contractors were encouraged to raise any sort of grievance in due process of implementing the project activity • Stakeholder meeting with the herders and the local communities residing in and around was conducted to create awareness and availability of project. 		

Jomotsangkha Wildlife Sanctuary

Activity	ESS Plans	ESS compliance	Issues	Remarks
Construction of caretaker residence				<p>The ESMP indicates the activity as the "Establishment of Paris polyphylla Nursery," whereas the monitoring report states it as the "Construction of caretaker residence." This disparity in reporting reflects a lack of diligence.</p>

Phrumsengla National Park

Activity	ESS Plans	ESS compliance	Issues	Remarks
Construction and maintenance of staff quarter	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Proper waste management • Minimal sound and air pollution. • Workers health and safety measures. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Contractors were made to manage their own construction waste at their own sites as per the agreement drawn. Cleaning of construction sites after the completion of work were strictly monitored • Restriction on use of only 1 good conditioned chainsaw at each construction site. Restricted working time from 7:00am to 7:00pm • Workers health and safety measures were taken care by the community contractor themselves, we monitored and ensured the issuance of safety helmets, gumboots and hand gloves for their workers as per the contract agreement drawn with them 	No issues	
<i>Construction of 2 traditional bridges (Bazam) along TBT (Trans-Bhutan Trail)</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Proper waste management • Minimize noise disturbance to wildlife from the use of outdoor equipments like power chain saw at construction site. • No contamination 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No non-degradable waste generated since workers did not camp at construction site, they worked with packed lunch from their home. Those resized timber wastes were gathered and disposed out of sight. 	No issues	

Activity	ESS Plans	ESS compliance	Issues	Remarks
	<p>of river by construction wastes.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Minimal disturbance to wildlife habitat • Workers health and safety measures 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Restriction on use of only 2 good conditioned chainsaw at each construction site. Restricted working time from 7:00am to 7:00pm. • Strict monitoring of construction wastes, no generation non-degradable waste from construction • Restricted dumping of degradable wastes like resized timbers in the river. • No construction of labour camp at construction site, no deployment of heavy machinery, all work done manually. • Workers health and safety measures are taken care by the community contractor themselves, we monitored and ensured the issuance of safety helmets, gumboots and hand gloves for their workers as per the contract agreement drawn with them 		

Royal Manas National Park

Activity	ESS Plans	ESS compliance	Issues	Remarks
Restoration of lowland grasslands	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Plantation of native species and avoid planting invasive species 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Planted only native grass species after assessing suitability of species in terms of local needs and survival. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Early monsoon caused forest road blockage and affected transportation of native grass stems for 	It is advisable to incorporate weather considerations into the proper planning of activity implementation in the future activities.

Activity	ESS Plans	ESS compliance	Issues	Remarks
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Felling of trees encroaching inside grassland • Reduce waste generation 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Invasive species grown at the site were cut/uprooted and disposed • To reduce/avoid the impacts of climate change on lowland grasslands and for the sustainable management of the grasslands, some of the trees were retained in the area • Removal of trees were done in an environmentally sustainable ways and ensured no accidental damage is caused to the local vegetation trees were retained in the area • Laborers were briefed about the waste management and the waste bins and signboards were installed at activity sites 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> plantation at the site • Uprooting of woody invasive species were difficult • Many of the tree species in the area were coppicing trees which easily invade grasslands • Lack of availability to advanced and more environmentally friendly technologies • Collecting of wastes after the completion of activity was difficult in the area were there were no road access 	<p>Promote the practice of composting from green waste as a means to reduce overall waste.</p>
<p>River bank protection at Manas river</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Minimize disturbance of natural habitat • Waste management during construction 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Soil excavation were carried out with minimal impact to surrounding natural habitats • Heavy machineries were not used. • Proper containers/waste bins were temporarily installed at the project site 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Increase laborer requirement and time duration • Need to procure waste bins 	<p>Proper planning would be essential considering the nature of the task.</p> <p>The procurement of waste bins can be arranged if it is</p>

Activity	ESS Plans	ESS compliance	Issues	Remarks
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Minimize water contamination as a result of construction 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Dumping of waste in the river, in its vicinity, or in other non-designated places were avoided Waste bins from the sites were collected after the completion of activity and the wastes were disposed into proper place Dumping of construction materials or waste in the river were avoided 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> People are less concern to collect back the waste from site after completion of the activity. Need to transport waste to dumping site and it is difficult in a place where there is no road accessibility 	<p>included in the budget plan. The contract agreement should explicitly include provisions for waste clearance after the completion of work. If such provisions are already stated, the IA should enforce penalties as per the contract agreement.</p> <p>Explore the feasibility of burying waste in a secure location that minimizes the impact on water sources and reduces the risk to wildlife.</p>

Jigme Dorji National Park

Activity	ESS Plans	ESS compliance	Issues	Remarks
Renovation of Range Office	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Waste properly disposed into the dustbin 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Waste collected and burnt. 	Waste disposal is difficult due to remoteness and extreme weather	The IA should promote community engagement in waste reuse practices while strictly discouraging any form of burning.

Wangchuck Centennial National Park

Activity	ESS Plans	ESS compliance	Issues	Remarks
Restoration of lowland grassland	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Assess appropriateness of species in terms of biodiversity, water efficiency, forest fire, local needs, cultural 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Locally available species chosen 	No issues	

Activity	ESS Plans	ESS compliance	Issues	Remarks
	sensitivity, survival, etc <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Ensure that only native species are planted • Comply with the workers' health and safety guidelines • Ensure that no underage workers, or children are engaged • Avoid burning, if required do control burning 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Workers have used the safety equipment like gumboots • No underage labor engaged • No burning is done 		
Construction of river bank protection wall (Gabion wall)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Follow worker's health safety guidelines (BFL guidelines) • Ensure regular health screening for the workers pre and during activities • Ensure that no underage workers, or children are engaged • Decent work conditions, including an appropriate salary, working hours, accommodation and food for workers shall be provided to all workers • A grievance mechanism for workers to raise work place 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Health and safety measures of the workers were well ensured. • All the workers were of working age (Adults) as work was executed through community contract • No waste generation at the site as the workers were community workers and there was no requirement for workers camp construction • Workers well informed about GRM 	No issues	

Activity	ESS Plans	ESS compliance	Issues	Remarks
	<p>concerns should be in place</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Dumping of waste on the sides of the road, on private land, or in other non-designated places should be prohibited 			
Maintenance of staff quarter at Sephu Park range	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Follow the workers' health and safety guidelines as attached to the ESMP (BFL guidelines). • Decent work conditions, including an appropriate salary, working hours, accommodation and food for workers shall be provided to all workers • A grievance mechanism for workers to raise work place concerns should be in place. • Proper containers/waste bins should be provided at the project site • Dumping of waste on the sides of the road, on private land, or in other non-designated places should be prohibited; 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Safety of workers ensured • Work executed by community contract group and there was no issues • The group was well informed on GRM • Waste bins already in place in the premises of staff quarter • Waste properly managed 	No issues	

Activity	ESS Plans	ESS compliance	Issues	Remarks
Construction of rangers transit camp	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Construction sites, transportation routes and materials handling sites should be water sprayed on dry and windy days Workers should wear protective masks if dust appears Burning of plastic origin debris will be prohibited 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Construction completed Site in-charge has ensured the safety wears for th workers No waste and debris were burned at construction site 	No issues	

Phibsoo Wildlife Sanctuary

Activity	ESS Plans	ESS compliance	Issues	Remarks
Management of Lowland grassland	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Occurrence of non-native species Air Pollution Grassland Fire Accidental removal of Endangered species 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Only native grass, Themda Planted Controlled burning has been practiced Grassland has been compartmentalized and burring operated in compartments Followed the recommendation of preliminary reports, mapping for herpetofuana completed and publication carried out by staffs 	No issues	
Installation of Solar Hybrid System	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Risk that lack of proper maintenance of the solar panels will result in environmental Worker's health and Safety 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> SOP for Solar Developed Public not involved in working officials from JB solar and PWS team completed the works. Workig 	No issues	

Activity	ESS Plans	ESS compliance	Issues	Remarks
		facilities including housing for workers provided at Phibsoo Outpost station ny the management		
Maintenance of PWS HQ	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reduce noise disturbance • Waste management • Worker's health and Safety 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Staff offices shifted to new Range office till completion. • Every 9th of the month, cleaning was carried out and waste collected and disposed in pits. Extra sheets were collected by suppliers and disposed in proper site • Underage workers were not recruited for the maintenance, decent working salary of average Nu.1000 per day were provided to workers. Since workers preferred to stay at home, accommodations were not provided 	No issues	

NB: Reports from JSWNP and SWS could not be availed

BC1

Activity	ESS Plans	ESS compliance	Issues	Remarks
Construction RCC water tank stand at Jitsephu	<p>Reduce of waste and noise</p> <p>Ensure workers safety</p>	All ESS measures taken care during the construction	No issues	The IA should have incorporated the construction of RCC water tank stand into the construction plans for the Range office.
Blacktopping of headquarter Office at Paro town	Reduce of waste and noise	All ESS measures taken care during the construction	No issues	

	Ensure workers safety		
--	-----------------------	--	--

BC2

Activity	ESS Plans	ESS compliance	Issues	Remarks
Maintenance/improvement of access road from Peljorling to Chuba	Noise disturbance reduced Air quality maintained Waste Workers health and safety Local community's health and safety	Work was done during the day so that the activities wont disturb the local Spraying of water to reduce dust emissions, vehicle emissions tested as required by the law, protective mask to be workers Waste were collected and put in waste bins during and after construction Workers were equipped with safety gears as required Waste were collected and put in waste bins during and after construction, safety of locals ensured	No issues	
Development of parking and access road in the newly constructed campsite	Noise disturbance reduced Waste managed Soil erosion, landslides and flooding Workers health and safety	As the work was minimal, no noise disturbance was there with campsite located away from the community. Work was done during the day to reduce noise disturbance The construction waste were disposed in designated waste bins No soil erosion, landslides or flooding as the work was on a very small scale Provided with safety gears	No issues	
Construction of kitchen site and terracing of land for tent pitching inside the campsite	Waste managed Disturbance to the soil	Less waste generation and the little amount of waste generated were disposed in designated waste bin It was done during non-monsoon season with minimizing the slope	No issues	

	Workers health and safety	disturbance, avoiding steep areas Workers were provided with safety gears		
Expansion and Maintenance of wildlife rescue shelter	Noise Disturbance Waste generation Workers health and safety	Work was done during the day to avoid disturbance to the nearby communities Waste generated were disposed in the designated waste bin Workers were provided with safety gears	No issues	

BC 3

Activity	ESS Plans	ESS compliance	Issues	Remarks
Construction of range office at Mendrelgang	Activity deferred	Activity deferred	Activity deferred	The activity will be implemented in 2023. PCU should take note of it.

BC4

Activity	ESS Plans	ESS compliance	Issues	Remarks
Improvement of low grassland at Pirchen by removing unwanted invasive alien species and promoting grass growth by controlled patch burning	The labourers were issued safety gears and the waste was managed successfully	Individual waste were collected and dumped in the designated site	No issues	

BC6

Activity	ESS Plans	ESS compliance	Issues	Remarks
Maintenance of Beat Office, Thrimshing	Proper waste segregation and management Infrastructure such as drain and footpath with all ESS measures	Individual waste bins installed and disposed as per Dungkhag requirements Constructed as per the design and request of nearby community, BHU and Dungkhag and	No issues	

		ESS measures taken care		
				<p>There is a no reporting on the progress of the two activities.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Maintenance of Beat Office, Khaling - Material Support for the Tshendaling CFMG members for Furniture production

NB: Reports from BC5, BC7 and BC8 could not be availed

3.2.2 Comments

- a. The BFL focal at IA and field staff demonstrated a high level of confidence in carrying out the ESS mitigation plans. Throughout the reporting period, there were minimal issues, aside from a small number of newly joined field staff members who lacked training in ESS-related matters.
- b. The transfer of BFL focal at IA is an ongoing issue which was pointed out in the last two reports as well. In such a situation, the new comer who can be totally new to ESS had to implement the ESS mitigation plans when he/she was not aware of. Some challenges arise under such circumstances, however, the field staff stated with support from colleagues, they manage the tasks. For example, JWS and JSWNP had new BFL focal to implement ESS plans.
- c. The BFL focal in the PAs and BCs face challenges as they have various responsibilities, making it difficult for them to allocate dedicated time solely to BFL project.
- d. A discrepancy has been observed between the activity mentioned in the ESMP and the corresponding entry in the monitoring report for JWS. The ESMP indicates the activity as the "Establishment of Paris polyphylla Nursery," whereas the monitoring report states it as the "Construction of caretaker residence." This disparity in reporting reflects a lack of diligence.
- e. In JDNP, a mismatch between the ESMP and Monitoring report has been identified. The ESMP explicitly addresses the importance of appropriate waste management in the maintenance of the Lunana Park range office, whereas the monitoring report reveals that the waste has been burnt.

- f. The feedback provided by the field staff responsible for implementing the activities highlights that they receive valuable support from management, BFL focal personnel, and colleagues when it comes to conducting ESS activities.
- g. The release of funds at times poses a challenge to the timely implementation of activities. Certain ESS mitigation measures, such as bridge construction, have specific time constraints. Consequently, the implementation of ESS measures would be adversely impacted.
- h. Ensuring continuous capacity enhancement is crucial for all PAs and BCs. The BFLFS and PCU should prioritize training programs for newly appointed staff members taking on the role of BFL focal at IA. Additionally, it is important to address the capacity enhancement of GRM focal at IA as well.
- i. According to feedback received from various sites, it has been noted that workers, particularly workers from local communities, show a reluctance to use personal protective equipment (PPE) such as helmets, earplugs, and gloves as they were not use to it.
- j. The feedback received from the sites highlighted that despite monitoring visits conducted by the BFL focal at IA, CFOs, and PCU, there remains a need for site visits from ESS experts from BFLFS during the implementation phase. Such visits would offer expert perspectives on ESS implementation and serve as an additional source of motivation for the field staff.
- k. The implementation of ESS measures has had a significant positive impact on both the local community and the environment. An example of this can be seen in the improvement of a 1.2-kilometer farm road in Khotokha under BC2, which has benefited the community and the local school. Furthermore, the enhanced road condition has effectively prevented tractors from traversing through the Ramsar site, thereby preserving its ecological integrity.
- l. The ESS team at PCU, PAs, and BCs has dedicated significant efforts to ensure the successful implementation of ESS measures, aiming to minimize the negative impact of BFL activities on the environment and local communities. As a result, the overall accomplishment in ESS implementation for the reporting period has been commendable.

3.2.3 Recommendations

- The BFL focal at IA should attempt to personally visit all the locations where ESS mitigation plans are in place, as outlined in the ESMP. During these visits, they should engage in discussions with the field officers responsible for executing the plans, focusing on the best approach to implementing them. Such interactions would not only strengthen

the field officers' competence in ESS implementation but also contribute to enhancing their capacity in this regard.

- A few BFL focal at IA and field officers have expressed that Bhutanese workers exhibit reluctance in using safety gears such as helmets, earplugs, and other gear during working hours. This hesitation is because the workers are not familiar using such gears. Nevertheless, in order to prioritize the safety of the workers, it is crucial for the BFL focal at IA and field officers to actively raise awareness among them about the significance of using safety gear for their own safety.
- To minimize expenses associated with occupational health and safety (OHS) requirements, it is advisable to outsource BFL activities of similar nature to a single contractor operating within the same locality, instead of engaging different contractors for each activity. This approach offers several benefits, including the potential for contractors to enhance their understanding of OHS practices and the reduction of project costs related to OHS. Currently, numerous small-scale construction projects struggle to comply fully with OHS requirements due to budget constraints. For instance, the construction of a parking facility for the eco-camp in Phobjikha had a budget of only Nu. 100,000, making it challenging for the contractor to afford necessary OHS equipment. In such cases, the BFL focal at IA had to personally bear the expenses and provide the required OHS equipment.
- The information put in the Monitoring Framework for ESMP Compliance (reporting template) lacks detail. As a result, it is difficult to derive meaningful insights from the report for evaluation purposes. It is essential to provide additional information that elaborates on how ESS compliance was implemented and the resulting environmental and societal benefits. Furthermore, the report should address how any challenges encountered were effectively tackled. By including these crucial details, the report would offer a more comprehensive and informative overview of the project's progress and outcomes.

4. Grievance Redressal Mechanism (GRM)

4.1 Observation

- The majority of BFL and GRM focal individuals have participated in GRM training facilitated by BFLFS and PCU. GRM process is an established practice, and the reporting of GRM is an integral part of BFL project activities.
- Only 1 PA and 1 BC (JDNP and BC8) conducted community sensitization on GRM for the reporting period. Rest have planned it in 2023.
- The GRM brochure, containing information about the GRM process and contact details, has been distributed to gewog centers, community groups, and individuals at project sites.

- There were no instances of GRM-related issues reported during the reporting period.
- The GRM disclosure is done through the websites of BFLFS, WWF-US Office, Department of Forest & Park Services and Ministry of Environment and Natural Resources.

4.2 Recommendation

- Despite previous efforts by the BFL focal at IA to raise awareness about grievance reporting within the communities, there remains a limited level of understanding among the community members. Consequently, it is necessary for the BFL focal at IA to allocate a budget and consistently conduct sensitization activities. By doing so, they can continuously educate and inform the community about the importance and process of grievance reporting.
- To enhance awareness among the local population, it would be more effective to create a video, documentary, or animated video that explains the processes of Grievance Redress Mechanism (GRM). Such visual mediums have the potential to effectively convey information and engage the audience, making them more accessible and engaging for the local community.

5. Monitoring and Evaluation

5.1 Observation

The BFL focal at IA holds the responsibility for monitoring BFL activities, as outlined in the ESMP. The ESMP provides a clear delegation of roles and responsibilities for monitoring the implementation of the ESS mitigation plan. Additionally, the ESMP includes a project timeline that serves as a guide for the BFL focal officer and other relevant personnel, indicating when monitoring visits should be scheduled.

The implementation of ESS mitigation plan is monitored at various levels:

- i. The field officers are accountable for executing BFL activities within their respective jurisdiction. As part of their role, they are responsible for monitoring ESS compliance during activity implementation. Some field officers have undergone training conducted by the BFL focal person, and they rely on their support when encountering challenges. Notably, no significant lapses were reported during the reporting period.
- ii. One of the responsibilities of the BFL focal at IA is to oversee the management of ESS mitigation plan implementation in the Protected Areas (PAs) and Biodiversity Corridors (BCs). Essentially, the majority of BFL focal at IA conduct a minimum of three monitoring visits. These visits are scheduled before the commencement of the activity, during the implementation phase, and upon its completion. During these visits,

- they offers guidance on ESS requirements, provides mid-course corrections as needed, and ensures the proper execution of the plan. Additionally, some Chief Field Officers (CFOs) provide feedback and provide corrections on ESS-related activities during their regular visits.
- iii. The Project Coordination Unit (PCU) team attempts to conduct one monitoring visit annually to the sites, but due to limited staff and a wide coverage area, they prioritize their visits accordingly. Several virtual meetings with BFL focal at IA and field officers were conducted during the reporting period.
 - iv. The officials from BFLFS during their regular monitoring visit, looks at ESS component and provide feedback for rectifications when needed.
 - v. BFLFS engages the services of an independent consultant to perform an evaluation of the annual implementation of Environmental and Social Safeguard (ESS) measures. The consultant's findings are compiled into a report, which is subsequently shared with the AE-WWF for review and approval.
 - vi. The ESS group has established both a WhatsApp and Gmail group to facilitate the exchange of ideas and discussion of relevant issues related to ESS.

5.2 Comments

- Based on feedback received from the field, there is a clear need for training field officers on ESS monitoring. While it is the responsibility of the BFL focal at IA to provide this training, there were limitations in terms of capacity, time and budget during the reporting period, resulting in the absence of a dedicated training program. A few trainings conducted were combined with other programs.
- Field officers from BC1 and BC2 have expressed their views that monitoring visits by ESS expert from PCU during the activity implementation would be highly beneficial. They believe that such visits would offer valuable insights from the experts' perspective on ESS implementation. Additionally, these visits would provide an opportunity for the field officers to learn from the expertise and knowledge of the experts.
- The BFL focal in the PAs and BCs, as well as the field officers in the range, carry multiple responsibilities in their roles. Consequently, the limited time available for the BFL focal officers to conduct ESS monitoring often results in either insufficient monitoring or delayed monitoring. This situation has adverse implications for meeting the ESS requirements and can hinder the overall progress in achieving ESS goals.
- Although the CFOs offer essential guidance to the BFL focal at IA and field officers, their presence at the activity sites appears to be infrequent due to their extensive responsibilities.

5.3 Recommendations

- There appears to be a low level of capacity among the field officers in terms of ESS monitoring. It is essential for the BFL focal at IA to allocate a budget specifically for enhancing the capacity of the field officers in this regard.
- In order to ensure the effective implementation of BFL activities, including ESS component, it is recommended that the PAs and BCs take steps to minimize the workload of the BFL focal officers. This can be achieved by allocating more dedicated time for them to focus on managing BFL activities. By reducing their workload and providing them with sufficient time, the BFL focal officers can better oversee the implementation of BFL initiatives, including ESS, leading to improved outcomes and effectiveness.
- The CFOs to make site visits during the implementation of ESS and provide guidance and support to the BFL focal officers throughout the process. By conducting site visits, the CFOs can provide valuable insights, assistance, and direction to the BFL focal at IA, ensuring the effective implementation of ESS measures. This collaborative approach strengthens the coordination between the CFOs and the BFL focal officers, enhancing the overall ESS implementation process.
- A few field officers have expressed their thoughts on the current practice of ESS evaluation. They noted that the evaluation is primarily based on the ESS implementation reports submitted by the field officers to PCU, along with some level of communication between the consultant and the field officers, and a brief field visit by the consultant. However, the field implementers believe that the evaluation process should involve visits by ESS experts both during the implementation and post-implementation phases. This would allow the experts to observe both the effective practices and any shortcomings in ESS implementation. Additionally, the presence of the ESS expert during these visits would provide an opportunity for on-the-spot corrective measures, thereby fostering capacity building among the field officers.

6. Capacity Need Assessment

To ensure the successful implementation and monitoring of Environmental and Social Safeguard (ESS) requirements, it is vital to enhance the capacity of project stakeholders. However, given that ESS is a relatively new subject among the Bhutanese, there is a recognized need for a comprehensive capacity building program targeting the BFL focal at IA, GRM focal, and field officers in range offices. An advance level training on ESS and GRM is also necessary for the focal at PCU.

To identify the specific capacity building needs, a comprehensive need assessment survey was conducted across 18 Protected Areas (PAs/BCs) with responses received from 13 of them. The analysis of these responses has indicated the following key findings:

Understanding: All 13 respondents have the broad understanding of ESS. They recognize that ESS plays a crucial role in protecting the environment and addressing social concerns arising from Bhutan for Life project activities.

Confidence: Confidence in managing ESS implementation was observed to some extent among the respondents. However, during one-to-one interactions, several officials expressed the need for training programs to enhance their confidence in effectively managing ESS. These trainings would play a crucial role in equipping them with the necessary skills and knowledge to address ESS-related challenges with confidence.

Capacity need: All of the respondents unanimously emphasized the need for capacity building opportunities. They specifically expressed their requirements for a comprehensive training program that covers various aspects, including planning, implementing, monitoring, and reporting. This highlights their desire to acquire the necessary skills and knowledge in these areas to enhance their effectiveness in ESS-related activities.

PA/BC	Understanding	Confidence	Capacity need
BWS			
JDNP	It is document with a set of policies and procedure to safeguard both environment and social (people) while implementation of any activities.	Yes	There is a need for additional training for field colleagues regarding Environmental and Social Safeguards (ESS) across various stages, including planning and reporting. This is particularly crucial since many project sites are under the purview of field offices such as range and beat offices
JKSNR	ESS means to identify, mitigate and overcome the probable environmental and social that might occur because of the project activities at the project site.	Yes to some extent	Capacity requirement in reporting
JSWNP	It is a proactive measure undertaken to prevent, manage and mitigate perceived threats to environment and social aspects as	I am aware of the process but I lack experience	Capacity requirement in reporting Planning, Implementation, Monitoring, Reporting

	a result of the project implementation.	to manage ESS program at the moment.	
JWS	Environmental and social safeguards refer to the guidelines, standards and operational procedures designed by development institutions and treaties to identify the impacts (environmental and social) and to avoid activities with adverse impacts upon implementation. ESS will also mitigate and minimize adverse impacts that may arise in the implementation of any development projects.	Quite confident	I would prefer additional capacity building in planning and implementation of ESS program
PNP	It's the process of addressing the risk of projects on environment and social.	Yes	Capacity requirement in planning and reporting
PWS			
RMNP			
SWS	If possible, avoid or mitigate any kind of environmental or social impact that shall/may arise due the implementation of the program	Yes	Capacity requirement in planning
WCNP	It serves as guide for the implementers to ensure safety	Yes	Capacity requirement in planning and reporting
BC1	To evaluate environment and social impact and mitigate the impact	Yes	Capacity requirement in planning and monitoring
BC2			
BC3	ESS is basically operational procedures designed to first identify and then try to avoid, mitigate and minimize adverse impact on environment and social	Yes	Capacity requirement in planning
BC4	The safeguards that are pivotal while implementing the project activities	Yes	Capacity requirement in monitoring
BC5			
BC6	Sets Tools and procedures to safeguards both environment and social impacts due to proposed activities	Yes	Capacity requirement in planning, monitoring and reporting

BC7	ESS includes standards, operational procedures, etc, that will identify and then try to avoid, mitigate and minimize adverse environmental and social impacts	Pretty confident	Planning, as good planning will lead to better implementation, monitoring and reporting
BC8	Complex Issue. Tug of War for existence.	To some extent. Similar to Extension activities.	Capacity requirement in planning and reporting

6.1 Recommendations

Developing a retention strategy for staff members who have undergone formal or informal training on ESS is crucial for both the BFLFS and PCU. Additionally, it is important to establish a streamlined knowledge transfer mechanism within the organization to ensure that knowledge and skills are effectively passed on in case the responsible official leaves the organization. The management should also consider allocating a dedicated budget for different stages of ESMP activities, such as planning, preparation, implementation, monitoring, and evaluation. By adopting this strategic approach, the organization can effectively manage and execute ESMP initiatives while ensuring the continuous presence of skilled personnel.

7. Conclusion

The evaluation of the Environmental and Social Safeguards of BFL projects for the year 2022 revealed positive progress as well as areas that need improvement. With the exception of 3 out of 58 planned activities that had ESS mitigation measures, the remaining activities were successfully implemented. The majority of BFL focal individuals in PAs and BCs have gained valuable experience in managing ESS mitigation measures. However, it is important to provide them with regular updates on new skills and techniques to effectively address ESS issues. The field officers appear to require additional training and capacity building.

The approval processes for ESMPs appear to be exhaustive and lengthy, which could potentially hinder the timely implementation of BFL activities. To streamline this process, it would be beneficial to assign the approval of ESMPs to the ESS specialist within the PCU, and share with AE-WWF for information and final endorsement. Additionally, there are concerns regarding whether all BFL activities require ESS mitigation plans, especially considering that some activities are small in scale and have minimal budgets. Furthermore, there are challenges related to the limited time available for BFL focal at IA to monitor activities due to their other responsibilities. Similarly, the CFOs allocate less time for monitoring activities due to their involvement in various other programs.

The findings of this evaluation offer valuable insights that can serve as a guidance for enhancing the implementation of ESS measures in future BFL activities. It is imperative for the AE-WWF, BFLFS, and PCU to persist in providing support to all PAs and BCs in terms of resources, expertise, and motivation. This collective effort is crucial for ensuring the successful execution of BFL activities, promoting sustainable development, and fostering responsible environmental practices.

8. Summary of key issues and recommendation

Theme	Key issues	Recommendations
Environment and Social Management Plan for 2022	Lengthy and cumbersome nature of the ESMP preparation	It is recommended that the BFL focal at IA takes on the responsibility of conducting ESS screening and preparing the ESMP. Subsequently, the ESMP can be reviewed and approved by the ESS specialist at the PCU. Once approved, the ESMP can be shared with the AE-WWF for their information and endorsement, thus streamlining the approval process and facilitating efficient implementation of ESS measures.
	Recurrence of ESS mitigation measures in ESPM	The PCU in consultation with AE-WWF, should make decision to do away with ESS mitigation plan for recurring activities.
	Budget for community consultation for ESMP preparation	In order to resolve the funding challenge related to community consultation for the ESMP, it is recommended that all PAs and BCs must incorporate budget for community consultation within their annual budget plan, specifically in the fourth quarter.
ESS compliance implementation	Frequent transfer of BFL focal at IA	Developing a retention strategy for staff members who have undergone formal or informal training on ESS may be necessary. It is important to establish a streamlined knowledge transfer mechanism within the organization to ensure that knowledge and skills are effectively passed on in case the responsible official leaves the organization.
	Overhead cost for small scale project activities	Outsource BFL activities of similar nature to a single contractor operating within the same locality, instead of engaging different contractors for each activity. This approach offers several benefits, including the potential for contractors to enhance their

		understanding of OHS practices and the reduction of project costs related to OHS
	Improvement in ESS compliance reporting system	It is important to uphold a certain level of seriousness among IA when reporting to ensure the receipt of good field reports. The existing ESS compliance monitoring report template may require revision to include only essential and relevant information.
	Discrepancy between the activity mentioned in the ESMP and the corresponding entry in the monitoring report	During this reporting period, several inconsistencies were identified. The ESS mitigation plan outlined in the ESMP does not align with the reported information. This mismatch indicates a lack of diligence on the part of IA. The PCU should be observant and take appropriate measures to address such errors.
	Improvement in documentation	The PCU should intensify its efforts to gather all essential data and information pertaining to ESS. Establishing a database would facilitate the storage and management of this data. Photographic evidences as a part of the report is essential. It is advisable to consider allocating more time for BFL focal at PCU to focus on BFL programs.
Grievance Redressal Mechanism (GRM)	Low level of awareness among community on grievance reporting	PAs and BCs should conduct GRM sensitization to local communities on a continuous basis. It would be more effective to create a video, documentary, or animated video that explains the processes of Grievance Redress Mechanism (GRM). Such visual mediums have the potential to effectively convey information and engage the audience, making them more accessible and engaging.
Monitoring & Evaluation	Inadequate monitoring visits to activity sites	Enhanced monitoring of BFL activities, with a specific focus on ESS, is necessary.

		Both the BFL focal at PCU and IA expressed concerns about time limitations for regular monitoring. The BFLFS should engage in discussions with DoFPS to reduce the workload of the focal individuals, allowing them more time to dedicate to BFL activities.
	Timely independent evaluation of ESS compliance	The evaluation process should involve visits by ESS experts both during the implementation and post-implementation phases. This would allow the experts to observe the effective practices and any shortcomings in ESS implementation. Additionally, the presence of the ESS expert during these visits would provide an opportunity for on-the-spot corrective measures, thereby fostering capacity building among the field officers.
	Low level of capacity among field officers in ESS monitoring	It is essential for the BFL focal at IA to allocate a budget specifically for enhancing the capacity of the field officers.

9. Pictures evidences



Farm road maintained by BC2 in Khotakha Ramsar site



Discussion with BC2 staff under Khotokha Range office



Parking space constructed by BC2 in Phobjikha Ramsar site



Discussion with beneficiaries in Phobjikha Ramsar site under BC2



Community consultation on the bridge construction for yak herders under JKSNR



Bridge constructed by JKSNR with well-maintained surrounding



Use of safety gears by workers during the construction of toilet in BC2 under Khotokha Range Office



Water storage stand constructed by BC1 under Tsento Range Office in Paro

Annexure: Survey on ESS activities for BFL focal and CFOs

The following survey was conducted by the consultant to collect information on the ESS implementation. Six BCs and Seven PAs responded to the survey.

Interview question on implementation of Environmental & Social Safeguards management in the PAs, BCs and Others

ESS focal person

This interview question is to gather information on the ESS process conducted in your PAs/BCs. The confidentiality of the respondents will be protected.

Question category	Interview questions	Responses
General information	Name of PAs/BCs	BC-01 Paro
	Respondents position	Sr. Forestry Officer
	How long have you been in this PAs/BCs	4 years
ESS capacity	Did you participate in ESS training and when	Yes, 2 times
	What is your understanding on Environmental & Social Safeguards	To evaluate environment and social impact and mitigate the impact
	Are you confident to manage ESS program in your PAs/BCs	Yes
	In-case you require additional capacity building in ESS, specify the area of requirement	Planning and monitoring
ESS implementation	What are the activities funded under BFL in your park/bc that required an ESMP	Construction
	What are some of the challenges you faced in the preparation of ESMP for the year 2022	To quantify materials, water and electricity use
	Were you able to implement all ESS activities you planned in 2022, if no what were the reasons behind	Yes since activities that implemented so far falls under govt. registered land
	What level of support you received during the implementation - From the management - From other colleagues	Good support from management and colleagues
	How do you monitor the follow up of ESS activities Who is doing the site monitoring? Are reports sent to BFL PCU? How often? What details?	-Monitor during visiting sites regularly. -CFO, focal and PCU - ESS compliance report
	Any observations on the impact of ESS implementation on the - Environment - Community	No

	Provide insights on any specific policies or guidelines that you follow to guide your work in implementing ESS	Forest rules, labor safety rules
Reporting	Is the ESS reporting procedure convenient to you? Any suggestions to improve it	Yes
Grievance reporting	In 2022, how many grievances received by the PAs/BCs	None
	How the PAs/BCs responded to the grievances	None
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Who is the designated officer for receiving grievances? How does the mechanisms work? b. Was there any awareness on this conducted for local communities in your park/bc? 	<p>Beat officer, Tsento and RO Paro</p> <p>-No but planned this year to conduct awareness</p>
	Any observations on the level of satisfaction of the reporters	No since none reported
Conclusion	Is there any additional information or key points you would like to share regarding the implementation of ESS in your PAs/BCs	In the field, is difficult to implement as per ESSP (example even if we provide boots and helmet to the worker, they are reluctant to wear since they said uncomfortable during the working)

Interview question on implementation of Environmental & Social Safeguards management in the PAs, BCs and Others

ESS focal person

This interview question is to gather information on the ESS process conducted in your PAs/BCs. The confidentiality of the respondents will be protected.

Question category	Interview questions	Responses
General information	Name of PAs/BCs	BC 3 Tsirang
	Respondents position	Sr. Forest Ranger
	How long have you been in this PAs/BCs	5 yrs
ESS capacity	Did you participate in ESS training and when	2020 and 2023
	What is your understanding on Environmental & Social Safeguards	ESS is basically operational procedures designed to first identify and then try to avoid, mitigate and minimize adverse impact on environment and social
	Are you confident to manage ESS program in your PAs/BCs	Yes
	In-case you require additional capacity building in ESS, specify the area of requirement	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Planning - Implementation - Monitoring - Reporting
ESS implementation	What are the activities funded under BFL in your park/bc that required an ESMP	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Plantation creation and maintenance - Construction
	What are some of the challenges you faced in the preparation of ESMP for the year 2022	Not much, ESMP preparation is time consuming and it has to go lot of process like ESS screening, consultation etc
	Were you able to implement all ESS activities you planned in 2022, if no what were the reasons behind	ESS activity for 2022 is deferred to year 2023, our construction work will commence from July 2023
	What level of support you received during the implementation <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - From the management - From other colleagues 	Very supportive, we work as a team

	<p>How do you monitor the follow up of ESS activities Who is doing the site monitoring? Are reports sent to BFL PCU? How often? What details?</p>	<p>Regular and periodically Field focal will do site monitoring and supervision on frequent basis, and I as focal will quarterly and monthly basis</p>
	<p>Any observations on the impact of ESS implementation on the</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Environment - Community 	
	<p>Provide insights on any specific policies or guidelines that you follow to guide your work in implementing ESS</p>	<p>Occupational Health and Safety</p>
Reporting	<p>Is the ESS reporting procedure convenient to you? Any suggestions to improve it</p>	<p>New version is comprehensive</p>
Grievance reporting	<p>In 2022, how many grievances received by the PAs/BCs</p>	<p>Nil</p>
	<p>How the PAs/BCs responded to the grievances</p>	<p>We register, investigate and resolve if any</p>
	<p>c. Who is the designated officer for receiving grievances? How does the mechanisms work? d. Was there any awareness on this conducted for local communities in your park/bc?</p>	<p>Chhimi, Sr FO Awareness on ESS, gender and grievances is planned in July 2023 for the community of Dunglagang and Patshaling</p>
	<p>Any observations on the level of satisfaction of the reporters</p>	<p>-</p>
Conclusion	<p>Is there any additional information or key points you would like to share regarding the implementation of ESS in your PAs/BCs</p>	<p>We will communicate to BFL ESS focal if any</p>

CFOs as the head of the management (PAs/BCs)

This interview question is to gather information on the ESS processes conducted in your PAs/BCs.

No	Interview questions	Responses
1	Name of PAs/BCs	BC 3 Tsirang
2	Respondents position	CFO
3	How long have you been in this PAs/BCs	I was in Phibsoo WS for 4 years and recently transferred to Tsirang Division as CFO
4	What is your understanding on Environmental & Social Safeguards	Not much, my BFL focal has planned to conduct one day awareness on 23 rd June 2023
5	Have you seen the ESMP 2022 for your park/bc? Where is it disclosed for easy access?	My focal will brief during awareness
6	How do you ensure the integration of ESS principles and practices in the overall management strategies of your PAs/BCs	For any project or regular activities we will incorporate principles and practices like OHS
7	What is your involvement in the ESS implementation processes	We will implement construction work from July 2023
8	What is the frequency of your interaction with the ESS focal on the update of ESS compliance	We are yet to implement
9	How do you monitor and evaluate the effectiveness of ESS measures in your PAs/BCs	ESS activity will be monitored by Management, BFL focal and site supervisor
10	What are some of the key challenges or obstacles you have encountered in implementing ESS measures	Yet to implement, it will be known as we implement activities
11	Is there any additional information or key points you would like to share regarding the implementation of ESS in your PAs/BCs	NO
12	GRM a. Who is the designated officer for receiving grievances in your park/bc? How does the mechanisms work? b. Was there any awareness on this conducted for local communities in your park/bc?	Chhimi SR FO is designated, as the old grievance officer resigned recently It is planned to do in July 2023

Interview question on implementation of Environmental & Social Safeguards management in the PAs, BCs and Others

ESS focal person

This interview question is to gather information on the ESS process conducted in your PAs/BCs. The confidentiality of the respondents will be protected.

Question category	Interview questions	Responses
General information	Name of PAs/BCs	BC4
	Respondents position	Senior Forestry Officer
	How long have you been in this PAs/BCs	6 years
ESS capacity	Did you participate in ESS training and when	Yes, in year 2020 and year 2023
	What is your understanding on Environmental & Social Safeguards	The safeguards that are pivotal while implementing the project activities
	Are you confident to manage ESS program in your PAs/BCs	Yes
	In-case you require additional capacity building in ESS, specify the area of requirement	- Monitoring
ESS implementation	What are the activities funded under BFL in your park/bc that required an ESMP	BC4 office construction, waterhole creation and enhancement, grassland development, campsite development
	What are some of the challenges you faced in the preparation of ESMP for the year 2022	There is no issue as such for 2022, only it was difficult to do compliance monitoring
	Were you able to implement all ESS activities you planned in 2022, if no what were the reasons behind	Yes, we have only few activities and was able to do it
	What level of support you received during the implementation - From the management - From other colleagues	Management and the colleagues are in full support of ESS implementation and compliance
	How do you monitor the follow up of ESS activities Who is doing the site monitoring? Are reports sent to BFL PCU? How often? What details?	ESS activities are monitored by visiting the site by ESS focal. We submit the compliance report every quarter to PCU, the report includes

		compliance with photographs
	Any observations on the impact of ESS implementation on the <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Environment - Community 	There is no negative impact by implementing ESS activities.
	Provide insights on any specific policies or guidelines that you follow to guide your work in implementing ESS	
Reporting	Is the ESS reporting procedure convenient to you? Any suggestions to improve it	Works Health Safety Guideline
Grievance reporting	In 2022, how many grievances received by the PAs/BCs	None
	How the PAs/BCs responded to the grievances	NA
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> e. Who is the designated officer for receiving grievances? How does the mechanisms work? f. Was there any awareness on this conducted for local communities in your park/bc? 	BFL focal, no awareness on grievance mechanism was conducted to date
	Any observations on the level of satisfaction of the reporters	NA
Conclusion	Is there any additional information or key points you would like to share regarding the implementation of ESS in your PAs/BCs	It is very difficult to monitor and report ESS activity compliance report. We need to have independent ESS compliance monitoring officer

CFOs as the head of the management (PAs/BCs)

This interview question is to gather information on the ESS processes conducted in your PAs/BCs.

No	Interview questions	Responses
1	Name of PAs/BCs	BC4
2	Respondents position	CFO
3	How long have you been in this PAs/BCs	5 months
4	What is your understanding on Environmental & Social Safeguards	Strategies in identifying, avoiding and minimizing adverse effects/impacts on both environment and social livelihoods
5	Have you seen the ESMP 2022 for your park/bc? Where is it disclosed for easy access?	No, but I have seen in other (former) project documents
6	How do you ensure the integration of ESS principles and practices in the overall management strategies of your PAs/BCs	Need to convince the beneficiaries with incentives especially for the environmental safeguards to materialize.
7	What is your involvement in the ESS implementation processes	Not involved at all in BC4
8	What is the frequency of your interaction with the ESS focal on the update of ESS compliance	Not even once as I joined recently
9	How do you monitor and evaluate the effectiveness of ESS measures in your PAs/BCs	Need to see the BC4 management plan
10	What are some of the key challenges or obstacles you have encountered in implementing ESS measures	Not yet encountered
11	Is there any additional information or key points you would like to share regarding the implementation of ESS in your PAs/BCs	People living within the BC4 need to be thoroughly convinced and incentivized so that their livelihood is not compromised at the cost of conservation
12	GRM a. Who is the designated officer for receiving grievances in your park/bc? How does the mechanisms work? b. Was there any awareness on this conducted for local communities in your park/bc?	a. Nature Conservation Section Head and CFO b. Yes, but need to increase the frequency and on regular basis.

Interview question on implementation of Environmental & Social Safeguards management in the PAs, BCs and Others

ESS focal person

This interview question is to gather information on the ESS process conducted in your PAs/BCs. The confidentiality of the respondents will be protected.

Question category	Interview questions	Responses
General information	Name of PAs/BCs	BC 6
	Respondents position	S r. FO
	How long have you been in this PAs/BCs	5 Years
ESS capacity	Did you participate in ESS training and when	Yes, 2019, 2023
	What is your understanding on Environmental & Social Safeguards	Sets Tools and procedures to safeguards both evs, and social impacts due to proposed activities
	Are you confident to manage ESS program in your PAs/BCs	Yes
	In-case you require additional capacity building in ESS, specify the area of requirement	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Planning, Yes - Implementation, No - Monitoring, Yes - Reporting, Yes
ESS implementation	What are the activities funded under BFL in your park/bc that required an ESMP	1. Construction, Maintenance, Waste bin & Management, ecotourism
	What are some of the challenges you faced in the preparation of ESMP for the year 2022	Challenges in terms of setting up monitoring and evaluation frame work, OHS compliance reporting
	Were you able to implement all ESS activities you planned in 2022, if no what were the reasons behind	No, contractors not willing to implement, some mitigation measures on OHS and ESS despite instruction
	What level of support you received during the implementation <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - From the management - From other colleagues 	Management: Full Supports from Colleagues; Supports from Geog and Dzongkhag Administration for technical inputs
	How do you monitor the follow up of ESS activities Who is doing the site monitoring? Are reports sent to BFL PCU? How often? What details?	Site Monitoring: Range Officer and Beat Officer, Yes, reports sent to BFL-PCU, after the completion of activities
	Any observations on the impact of ESS implementation on the <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Environment - Community 	Evs: EVS impact are avoided or mitigated Community: Community are not effected and are well aware of the

		rationale of activities being implanted
	Provide insights on any specific policies or guidelines that you follow to guide your work in implementing ESS	WWF SIPP framework and OHS guideline
Reporting	Is the ESS reporting procedure convenient to you? Any suggestions to improve it	Need online mechanism to draft ESS mitigation measures and reporting frameworks
Grievance reporting	In 2022, how many grievances received by the PAs/BCs	Na.
	How the PAs/BCs responded to the grievances	Grievance Redressal mechanism and focal is appointed
	<p>g. Who is the designated officer for receiving grievances? How does the mechanisms work?</p> <p>h. Was there any awareness on this conducted for local communities in your park/bc?</p>	<p>Ms.Chimi Dema, FO is designated focal for grievances. She works as per the framework prepared for grievances Redressal guideline of BFL.</p> <p>No awareness till date, we proposed to conducts soon by June 2023</p>
	Any observations on the level of satisfaction of the reporters	No comment
Conclusion	Is there any additional information or key points you would like to share regarding the implementation of ESS in your PAs/BCs	Na

CFOs as the head of the management (PAs/BCs)

This interview question is to gather information on the ESS processes conducted in your PAs/BCs.

No	Interview questions	Responses
1	Name of PAs/BCs	BC 6
2	Respondents position	CFO
3	How long have you been in this PAs/BCs	4 Year
4	What is your understanding on Environmental & Social Safeguards	It is important tool to screen important environment impact, environment play a crucial role for the sustainability of any activities done.
5	Have you seen the ESMP 2022 for your park/bc? Where is it disclosed for easy access?	Yes, social media and website as well as hard copies maintained in office
6	How do you ensure the integration of ESS principles and practices in the overall management strategies of your PAs/BCs	Do not propose any activities if ESS is not in favour
7	What is your involvement in the ESS implementation processes	Planning, review and endorsement phase
8	What is the frequency of your interaction with the ESS focal on the update of ESS compliance	As and when required during implementation phase
9	How do you monitor and evaluate the effectiveness of ESS measures in your PAs/BCs	Informal, formal complain
10	What are some of the key challenges or obstacles you have encountered in implementing ESS measures	Contractor rarely implements
11	Is there any additional information or key points you would like to share regarding the implementation of ESS in your PAs/BCs	Social screening and consultation need separate budget as we are engaging communities/farmers and to get full support
12	GRM a. Who is the designated officer for receiving grievances in your park/bc? How does the mechanisms work? b. Was there any awareness on this conducted for local communities in your park/bc?	DFO office, Range office, focal at division Awareness is scheduled in June 2023

Interview question on implementation of Environmental & Social Safeguards management in the PAs, BCs and Others

ESS focal person

This interview question is to gather information on the ESS process conducted in your PAs/BCs. The confidentiality of the respondents will be protected.

Question category	Interview questions	Responses
General information	Name of PAs/BCs	BC 7
	Respondents position	Sr. FR II
	How long have you been in this PAs/BCs	Have been looking after BC's recently only as an alternate focal
ESS capacity	Did you participate in ESS training and when	Yes (8-10/05/2023)
	What is your understanding on Environmental & Social Safeguards	ESS includes standards, operational procedures, etc, that will identify and then try to avoid, mitigate and minimize adverse environmental and social impacts
	Are you confident to manage ESS program in your PAs/BCs	Pretty confident
	In-case you require additional capacity building in ESS, specify the area of requirement	Planning, as good planning will lead to better implementation, monitoring and reporting
ESS implementation	What are the activities funded under BFL in your park/bc that required an ESMP	-Maintenance of Autsho Beat Office and Tangmachu Checkpost - Development of Golden Mahseer high end fishing at Yangbari
	What are some of the challenges you faced in the preparation of ESMP for the year 2022	I have not prepared any ESMP as of now
	Were you able to implement all ESS activities you planned in 2022, if no what were the reasons behind	I am new to implementation of the planned ESS activities
	What level of support you received during the implementation - From the management - From other colleagues	As I am new to implementation of the planned ESS activities, I may not do justice in answering this question
	How do you monitor the follow up of ESS activities Who is doing the site monitoring? Are reports sent to BFL PCU? How often? What details?	I think the monitoring of ESS activities should be as per the ESMP. As of now the site monitoring is done by both the field staffs and the BFL focal. The reports are sent quarterly and includes details like

		name of activity, ESMP compliance, issues, date of monitoring and etc.
	Any observations on the impact of ESS implementation on the - Environment - Community	As I am new to implementation of the planned ESS, I may not do justice in answering this question
	Provide insights on any specific policies or guidelines that you follow to guide your work in implementing ESS	Regulation on Occupational Health, Safety and Welfare
Reporting	Is the ESS reporting procedure convenient to you? Any suggestions to improve it	Yes, quarterly is convenient
Grievance reporting	In 2022, how many grievances received by the PAs/BCs	None
	How the PAs/BCs responded to the grievances	NA
	i. Who is the designated officer for receiving grievances? How does the mechanisms work?	The grievance focal person of the Division. The logical steps for grievance resolution process as per the grievance redressal mechanism is: -Receive and register grievance - Acknowledge, Assess and Assign -Proposed response -Drawing agreement and response -Implement agreed response
	j. Was there any awareness on this conducted for local communities in your park/bc?	We have plans to conduct in July, 2023
	Any observations on the level of satisfaction of the reporters	NA
Conclusion	Is there any additional information or key points you would like to share regarding the implementation of ESS in your PAs/BCs	The focal person within the office is not always permanent and needs to be replaced by someone who is not trained when the trained focal person gets transferred, goes on EOL, etc. So timely capacity building on preparation of ESMP and implementation in the field is required.

Interview question on the implementation of Environmental & Social Safeguards management in the PAs, BCs, and Others

ESS focal person

This interview question is to gather information on the ESS process conducted in your PAs/BCs. The confidentiality of the respondents will be protected.

Question category	Interview Questions	Responses
General information	Name of PAs/BCs	BC8
	Respondents position	DCFO
	How long have you been in this PAs/BCs	1 Year
ESS capacity	Did you participate in ESS training and when	Yes, 8-10 May 2023
	What is your understanding of Environmental & Social Safeguards	Complex Issue. Tug of War for existence.
	Are you confident to manage the ESS program in your PAs/BCs	To some extent. Similar to Extension activities.
	In case you require additional capacity building in ESS, specify the area of requirement	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Planning - Implementation - Monitoring - Reporting
ESS implementation	What are the activities funded under BFL in your park/bc that required an ESMP	Gender Mainstreaming Lowland Grassland Mgt.
	What are some of the challenges you faced in the preparation of ESMP for the year 2022	Coinciding with farming Activities and the DSA, Food, and refreshment rates of the MoF are low to encourage the participants.
	Were you able to implement all ESS activities you planned in 2022, if no what were the reasons behind	Yes, implemented in 2022.
	What level of support you received during the implementation <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - From the management - From other colleagues 	Active roles and support from Mgnt. & received good participation from colleagues.
	How do you monitor the follow-up of ESS activities Who is doing the site monitoring? Are reports sent to BFL PCU? How often? What details?	Based on farmers' problems & HWC. Focal and the CFO. Reports - Yes, Annual basis. No. of incidences/cases of damage or Kills.
	Any observations on the impact of ESS implementation on the <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Environment 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Env.(Weather conditions, seasonal pattern.

	- Community	- Comm (Understanding and attitude of the people).
	Provide insights on any specific policies or guidelines that you follow to guide your work in implementing ESS	- No. specific policies. - Follow Protocol procedures and one's PR.
Reporting	Is the ESS reporting procedure convenient for you? Any suggestions to improve it	Looks lengthy but as a conservationist one must abide by the existing procedure. Up to the Project mandates.
Grievance reporting	In 2022, how many grievances were received by the PAs/BCs	Many
	How the PAs/BCs responded to the grievances	
	k. Who is the designated officer for receiving grievances? How do the mechanisms work? l. Was there any awareness of this conducted for local communities in your park/bc?	a) Coordinated by the Head and the Agencies concerned. Not much. b) Yes both in local and national media.
	Any observations on the level of satisfaction of the reporters	To some extent.
Conclusion	Is there any additional information or key points you would like to share regarding the implementation of ESS in your PAs/BCs	Different ideas from the community. Limitations in Budget as an entitlement. Since BC8 is in another Dzongkhag, it needs to consider their time and interest. Complicated and requires enough travel, consultation, and participation from other agencies. That's All I can share with you.

Interview question on implementation of Environmental & Social Safeguards management in the PAs, BCs and Others

ESS focal person

This interview question is to gather information on the ESS process conducted in your PAs/BCs. The confidentiality of the respondents will be protected.

Question category	Interview questions	Responses
General information	Name of PAs/BCs	JDNP
	Respondents position	Forestry Officer
	How long have you been in this PAs/BCs	3 years
ESS capacity	Did you participate in ESS training and when	Yes, 2023
	What is your understanding on Environmental & Social Safeguards	It is document with a set of policies and procedure to safeguard both environment and social (people) while implementation of any activities.
	Are you confident to manage ESS program in your PAs/BCs	Yes
	In-case you require additional capacity building in ESS, specify the area of requirement	There is a need for additional training for field colleagues regarding Environmental and Social Safeguards (ESS) across various stages, including planning and reporting. This is particularly crucial since many project sites are under the purview of field offices such as range and beat offices
ESS implementation	What are the activities funded under BFL in your park/bc that required an ESMP	1. Construction of ecotourism facilities (Thangthangkha, Komatshachu restoration, Campsite development)

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 2. Offices maintenance (Lunana Range Offices, Park HQ) 3. Control of invasive plants 4. Saltlicks and waterholes restoration
	<p>What are some of the challenges you faced in the preparation of ESMP for the year 2022</p>	<p>The formulation of an Environmental and Social Management Plan (ESMP) necessitates community consultation. Without a dedicated budget for consultation, it becomes challenging to establish effective social safeguards. Additionally, in order to comprehensively grasp the environmental aspects, it is imperative to conduct site visits to the proposed activity locations</p>
	<p>Were you able to implement all ESS activities you planned in 2022, if no what were the reasons behind</p>	<p>Yes</p>
	<p>What level of support you received during the implementation</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - From the management - From other colleagues 	<p>Management and field colleagues collaborate closely during the implementation of activities.</p>
	<p>How do you monitor the follow up of ESS activities Who is doing the site monitoring? Are reports sent to BFL PCU? How often? What details?</p>	<p>Monitoring is conducted at least three times: at the onset of activities, in the middle phase, and upon completion. The reports are then submitted to the BFL PCU during the annual reporting process.</p>
	<p>Any observations on the impact of ESS implementation on the</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Environment - Community 	<p>During on process of implementation of activities till now we have not came across any</p>

		adverse environmental and social impacts.
	Provide insights on any specific policies or guidelines that you follow to guide your work in implementing ESS	Occupational health and safety, FNCA 1995, Environment act, Water act, Waste management rules and regulation etc.
Reporting	Is the ESS reporting procedure convenient to you? Any suggestions to improve it	Yes it is convenient
Grievance reporting	In 2022, how many grievances received by the PAs/BCs	Nil
	How the PAs/BCs responded to the grievances	Non
	<p>m. Who is the designated officer for receiving grievances? How does the mechanisms work?</p> <p>n. Was there any awareness on this conducted for local communities in your park/bc?</p>	<p>a. Protection section Mr. Jigme Gyeltshen was appointed as grievance officer. As a focal he received the grievances.</p> <p>b. To date, no awareness program has been conducted for the local communities regarding the grievance redressal mechanism.</p>
	Any observations on the level of satisfaction of the reporters	Not yet
Conclusion	Is there any additional information or key points you would like to share regarding the implementation of ESS in your PAs/BCs	

Interview question on implementation of Environmental & Social Safeguards management in the PAs, BCs and Others

ESS focal person

This interview question is to gather information on the ESS process conducted in your PAs/BCs. The confidentiality of the respondents will be protected.

Question category	Interview questions	Responses
General information	Name of PAs/BCs	JKSNR,Haa
	Respondents position	Sr. Forest Ranger
	How long have you been in this PAs/BCs	5 years
ESS capacity	Did you participate in ESS training and when	Yes, 2021, 2022 (virtually) & 2023 (In person)
	What is your understanding on Environmental & Social Safeguards	ESS means to identify, mitigate and overcome the probable environmental and social that might occur because of the project activities at the project site.
	Are you confident to manage ESS program in your PAs/BCs	Yes to some extent.
	In-case you require additional capacity building in ESS, specify the area of requirement	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Planning - Implementation - Monitoring - Reporting
ESS implementation	What are the activities funded under BFL in your park/bc that required an ESMP	Habitat management: Alpine grassland restoration at Chala, Nubtshonapatra and Lolithang; and Watershed management: Implementation of watershed protection activities (Reservoir construction, bioengineering work, pipeline replacing, and hydro-geological mapping) at Thangdokha village, Gakiling gewog.
	What are some of the challenges you faced in the preparation of ESMP for the year 2022	Consultation meeting with LG and community; and site assessment prior

		to arrival of budget (non-aware of budget at PCU).
	Were you able to implement all ESS activities you planned in 2022, if no what were the reasons behind	Yes, we are able to implement the activities approved in the ESMP.
	What level of support you received during the implementation <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - From the management - From other colleagues 	The management head and the colleagues have given full support from planning, implementation and monitoring of activities. All the activities are executed by respective section and range offices.
	How do you monitor the follow up of ESS activities Who is doing the site monitoring? Are reports sent to BFL PCU? How often? What details?	As approved in the ESMP, all the activities are monitored by forming monitoring team comprising of BFL focal, management head, and site engineers (quality assurance) at the project sites and submit the monitoring and ESS compliance report to ESS focal at PCU on quarterly basis. During the monitoring, the detailed approved (items, measurements, quality) are checked.
	Any observations on the impact of ESS implementation on the <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Environment - Community 	Minimal destruction at the project site (environment and social condition).
	Provide insights on any specific policies or guidelines that you follow to guide your work in implementing ESS	Strictly adhere on the approved ESMP guided by OHS, Forestry and Environmental policies.
Reporting	Is the ESS reporting procedure convenient to you? Any suggestions to improve it	Yes
Grievance reporting	In 2022, how many grievances received by the PAs/BCs	No
	How the PAs/BCs responded to the grievances	No

	<p>o. Who is the designated officer for receiving grievances? How does the mechanisms work?</p> <p>p. Was there any awareness on this conducted for local communities in your park/bc?</p>	<p>Two grievance focal are nominated in the office, BFL focal as a primary grievance and other official as secondary. As part of the training programs, we have highlighted on the existence of grievance cell in the office. Formal training will be conducted to officials, LG, communities and relevant stakeholders in July 2023.</p>
	<p>Any observations on the level of satisfaction of the reporters</p>	<p>NA</p>
<p>Conclusion</p>	<p>Is there any additional information or key points you would like to share regarding the implementation of ESS in your PAs/BCs</p>	<p>Good system.</p>

Interview question on implementation of Environmental & Social Safeguards management in the PAs, BCs and Others

ESS focal person

This interview question is to gather information on the ESS process conducted in your PAs/BCs. The confidentiality of the respondents will be protected.

Question category	Interview questions	Responses
General information	Name of PAs/BCs	JSWNP
	Respondents position	Forestry Officer
	How long have you been in this PAs/BCs	2 years
ESS capacity	Did you participate in ESS training and when	Yes. On 11/03/23 and 8-10/05/23 by BFL ESS officer. And once last year(2023) by previous BFL focal of JSWNP
	What is your understanding on Environmental & Social Safeguards	It is a proactive measure undertaken to prevent, manage and mitigate perceived threats to environment and social aspects as a result of the project implementation.
	Are you confident to manage ESS program in your PAs/BCs	I am aware of the process but I lack experience to manage ESS program at the moment.
	In-case you require additional capacity building in ESS, specify the area of requirement	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Planning - Implementation - Monitoring - Reporting (All of above)
ESS implementation	What are the activities funded under BFL in your park/bc that required an ESMP	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Improvement of alpine meadows 2. Maintenance of water supply in Nabji PRO 3. Plantation of bamboo in Landslide prone area in Korphu 4. Construction of river bank protection walls in Trong gewog
	What are some of the challenges you faced in the preparation of ESMP for the year 2022	Lack of experience was the most significant challenge.

	Were you able to implement all ESS activities you planned in 2022, if no what were the reasons behind	Being a new focal, I have no previous experience in implementation of ESS activities.
	What level of support you received during the implementation <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - From the management - From other colleagues 	Not applicable due to reason stated above.
	How do you monitor the follow up of ESS activities Who is doing the site monitoring? Are reports sent to BFL PCU? How often? What details?	Monitoring is done as per the monitoring arrangements reflected in the ESMP. The site monitoring is conducted by site level managers as well as from the head office and BFL PCU as reflected in the ESMP.
	Any observations on the impact of ESS implementation on the <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Environment - Community 	None as of now.
	Provide insights on any specific policies or guidelines that you follow to guide your work in implementing ESS	None. Only the guidance provided by the PCU
Reporting	Is the ESS reporting procedure convenient to you? Any suggestions to improve it	Yes
Grievance reporting	In 2022, how many grievances received by the PAs/BCs	None
	How the PAs/BCs responded to the grievances	NA
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Who is the designated officer for receiving grievances? How does the mechanisms work? b. Was there any awareness on this conducted for local communities in your park/bc? 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The primary and secondary Grievance Officers. Grievances are dealt with as per the BFL GRM manual. b. None that I know of.
	Any observations on the level of satisfaction of the reporters	NA
Conclusion	Is there any additional information or key points you would like to share regarding the implementation of ESS in your PAs/BCs	None.

CFOs as the head of the management (PAs/BCs)

This interview question is to gather information on the ESS processes conducted in your PAs/BCs.

No	Interview questions	Responses
1	Name of PAs/BCs	JSWNP
2	Respondents position	CFO
3	How long have you been in this PAs/BCs	5 years
4	What is your understanding on Environmental & Social Safeguards	It is the method in place to ensure that social and environmental threats that are foreseen prior to the implementation of the project activities are efficiently mitigated and managed.
5	Have you seen the ESMP 2022 for your park/bc? Where is it disclosed for easy access?	Yes. The e-copy is sent to all the staff in the common forum. A printed copy is available in the head office and all field offices for ready reference.
6	How do you ensure the integration of ESS principles and practices in the overall management strategies of your PAs/BCs	All the environmental, social and cultural impacts of various activities are considered prior to the implementation of any activity in the Management Plan.
7	What is your involvement in the ESS implementation processes	Being the head of the agency, I provide guidance on preparation of ESMP and Monitor compliance and implementation together with the BFL focal.
8	What is the frequency of your interaction with the ESS focal on the update of ESS compliance	As and when necessary.
9	How do you monitor and evaluate the effectiveness of ESS measures in your PAs/BCs	All the mitigation measures are already reflected in the ESMP and its compliance is monitored as per predefined schedule as well as opportunistic monitoring.
10	What are some of the key challenges or obstacles you have encountered in implementing ESS measures	Budget for ESS mitigation measures must be included in the activity budget which is already planned and set. However ESS planning is done afterwards. The lack of logical sequence in this process hinders

		effective planning and implementation (with respect to financial resources)
11	Is there any additional information or key points you would like to share regarding the implementation of ESS in your PAs/BCs	None
12	<p>GRM</p> <p>a. Who is the designated officer for receiving grievances in your park/bc? How does the mechanisms work?</p> <p>b. Was there any awareness on this conducted for local communities in your park/bc?</p>	<p>a. Grievances are received by all the incharges of Range Offices and Guardposts in the field. And additionally there are 2 designated officers in the head officers (Primary and Secondary Grievance Officers) namely, Mr. Sonam Dorji (Dy.CFO) and Mr. Jigme Rangdrel (FO) for receiving and managing grievances.</p> <p>b. Awareness has been conducted for the technical staff under JSWNP by the Grievance officers but Awareness to the local communities is not yet conducted. However, it is in the pipeline.</p>

Interview question on implementation of Environmental & Social Safeguards management in the PAs, BCs and Others

ESS focal person

This interview question is to gather information on the ESS process conducted in your PAs/BCs. The confidentiality of the respondents will be protected.

Question category	Interview questions	Responses
General information	Name of PAs/BCs	Jomotsangkha Wildlife Sanctuary
	Respondents position	Forestry Officer
	How long have you been in this PAs/BCs	Five months
ESS capacity	Did you participate in ESS training and when	Yes, May 8-10, 2023
	What is your understanding on Environmental & Social Safeguards	Environmental and social safeguards refer to the guidelines, standards and operational procedures designed by development institutions and treaties to identify the impacts (environmental and social) and to avoid activities with adverse impacts upon implementation. ESS will also mitigate and minimize adverse impacts that may arise in the implementation of any development projects.
	Are you confident to manage ESS program in your PAs/BCs	Quite confident
	In-case you require additional capacity building in ESS, specify the area of requirement	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Planning - Implementation - Monitoring - Reporting I would prefer additional capacity building in planning and implementation of ESS program
ESS implementation	What are the activities funded under BFL in your park/bc that required an ESMP	Construction Activities, and restoration of grassland.
	What are some of the challenges you faced in the preparation of ESMP for the year 2022	As a new BFL focal, I was not involved in preparation of ESMP 2022.

	<p>Were you able to implement all ESS activities you planned in 2022, if no what were the reasons behind</p>	<p>NA, as I was appointed as the new focal only in May 2023.</p>
	<p>What level of support you received during the implementation</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - From the management - From other colleagues 	<p>NA, as I was appointed as the new focal only in May 2023.</p>
	<p>How do you monitor the follow up of ESS activities Who is doing the site monitoring? Are reports sent to BFL PCU? How often? What details?</p>	<p>NA, as a new focal, I was not involved in any of these activities</p>
	<p>Any observations on the impact of ESS implementation on the</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Environment - Community 	<p>Environment: It protects the environment by preventing or minimizing adverse impacts of any projects on ecosystems, biodiversity, microclimate, and water quality, or generally on natural resources. It also ensures proper waste management, pollution control, and land rehabilitation, leading to improved environmental conditions.</p> <p>Community: It encompasses on sustainable development of communities by promoting livelihood enhancement programs which includes skilling, diversifying income-generation activities, preserving and promoting the indigenous livelihood activities. Moreover, it ensures the activities are environmentally friendly as well as considers the well-being of the local people as it incorporates climate resilience and co-creation into development plans, thus actively involving the local people and ensuring resilient and sustainable future.</p>

	Provide insights on any specific policies or guidelines that you follow to guide your work in implementing ESS	As a new focal with no involvement in implementing ESS -Couldn't provide any insights on any polices and guidelines.
Reporting	Is the ESS reporting procedure convenient to you? Any suggestions to improve it	Yes, the reporting procedure is convenient
Grievance reporting	In 2022, how many grievances received by the PAs/BCs	No, grievances as such received in 2022
	How the PAs/BCs responded to the grievances	
	<p>q. Who is the designated officer for receiving grievances? How does the mechanisms work?</p> <p>r. Was there any awareness on this conducted for local communities in your park/bc?</p>	<p>No, BFL grievances focal specifically appointed as of now but will appoint soon accordingly with the new Grievance Redressal Mechanism (GRM) procedure which mandates a grievance focal in every PA headquarter and range offices.</p> <p>Will conduct soon (June to July)</p>
	Any observations on the level of satisfaction of the reporters	No information as of now
Conclusion	Is there any additional information or key points you would like to share regarding the implementation of ESS in your PAs/BCs	It is imperative to conduct comprehensive baseline assessments as it is crucial to understand the existing environmental and social conditions in and around the project area. These assessments will help identify potential risks, impacts, and opportunities, thus guiding proper design and implementation of activities.

CFOs as the head of the management (PAs/BCs)

This interview question is to gather information on the ESS processes conducted in your PAs/BCs.

No	Interview questions	Responses
1	Name of PAs/BCs	Ugyen Tshering, JWS
2	Respondents position	Offtg. CFO
3	How long have you been in this PAs/BCs	Since August 2017
4	What is your understanding on Environmental & Social Safeguards	ESS is a tool that ensures negative impact on environment and society (people) from a project/program/activity are avoided or mitigated
5	Have you seen the ESMP 2022 for your park/bc? Where is it disclosed for easy access?	We have handed over a copy of the ESMP to respective gewog
6	How do you ensure the integration of ESS principles and practices in the overall management strategies of your PAs/BCs	We do ESS while finalizing the activity or program
7	What is your involvement in the ESS implementation processes	Review the ESS plan
8	What is the frequency of your interaction with the ESS focal on the update of ESS compliance	Before, during and after the completion of an activity
9	How do you monitor and evaluate the effectiveness of ESS measures in your PAs/BCs	Make site visit
10	What are some of the key challenges or obstacles you have encountered in implementing ESS measures	We did not encountered challenges while implementation but during planning of mitigation measure, it is a challenge to design and estimate the mitigation measures involving civil works. We lack technical knowledge in civil engineering work
11	Is there any additional information or key points you would like to share regarding the implementation of ESS in your PAs/BCs	
12	GRM a. Who is the designated officer for receiving grievances in your park/bc? How does the mechanisms work? b. Was there any awareness on this conducted for local communities in your park/bc?	We have appointed G2C focal as designated officer at head office and Respective Range Officers No formal awareness conducted to the local communities

Interview question on implementation of Environmental & Social Safeguards management in the PAs, BCs and Others

ESS focal person

This interview question is to gather information on the ESS process conducted in your PAs/BCs. The confidentiality of the respondents will be protected.

Question category	Interview questions	Responses
General information	Name of PAs/BCs	Phrumsengla National Park
	Respondents position	FO
	How long have you been in this PAs/BCs	2 years
ESS capacity	Did you participate in ESS training and when	Yes on 10/05/2023
	What is your understanding on Environmental & Social Safeguards	It's the process of addressing the risk of projects on environment and social.
	Are you confident to manage ESS program in your PAs/BCs	yes
	In-case you require additional capacity building in ESS, specify the area of requirement	- Planning - Reporting
ESS implementation	What are the activities funded under BFL in your park/bc that required an ESMP	Only Bio-engineering (bamboo plantation) in the 2022
	What are some of the challenges you faced in the preparation of ESMP for the year 2022	Short time line for preparation of ESMP, as most of the project sites are not nearby.
	Were you able to implement all ESS activities you planned in 2022, if no what were the reasons behind	Yes
	What level of support you received during the implementation - From the management - From other colleagues	Technical support from the management. Filed based information from other colleagues.
	How do you monitor the follow up of ESS activities Who is doing the site monitoring? Are reports sent to BFL PCU? How often? What details?	The follow up of ESS is monitored as per the date lines reflected in the ESMP developed for the particular activities. The Range Officer and the site in-charge are monitoring the activities most of the time. The report to PCU with detail

		activities and budgeting is yet to submit to BFL PCU.
	Any observations on the impact of ESS implementation on the <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Environment - Community 	Minimize the impact to the environment, especially the waste management. The ESS includes the safe guard and wellbeing of the community those who are involved in the project.
	Provide insights on any specific policies or guidelines that you follow to guide your work in implementing ESS	Non except the guidance provided by the PCU
Reporting	Is the ESS reporting procedure convenient to you? Any suggestions to improve it	Yes, it is convenient
Grievance reporting	In 2022, how many grievances received by the PAs/BCs	Non
	How the PAs/BCs responded to the grievances	NA
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> s. Who is the designated officer for receiving grievances? How does the mechanisms work? t. Was there any awareness on this conducted for local communities in your park/bc? 	BFL focal As per the manual of Grievance Redressal Mechanism The awareness is yet to conduct
	Any observations on the level of satisfaction of the reporters	NA
Conclusion	Is there any additional information or key points you would like to share regarding the implementation of ESS in your PAs/BCs	Non

Interview question on implementation of Environmental & Social Safeguards management in the PAs, BCs and Others

ESS focal person

This interview question is to gather information on the ESS process conducted in your PAs/BCs. The confidentiality of the respondents will be protected.

Question category	Interview questions	Responses
General information	Name of PAs/BCs	Sakteng Wildlife Sanctuary
	Respondents position	Sr. Ranger
	How long have you been in this PAs/BCs	18 years
ESS capacity	Did you participate in ESS training and when	Yes, March 2023
	What is your understanding on Environmental & Social Safeguards	If possible, avoid or mitigate any kind of environmental or social impact that shall/may arise due the implementation of the program
	Are you confident to manage ESS program in your PAs/BCs	Yes
	In-case you require additional capacity building in ESS, specify the area of requirement	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Planning ✓ - Implementation - Monitoring - Reporting - Sufficient funding ✓
ESS implementation	What are the activities funded under BFL in your park/bc that required an ESMP	Programs that shall directly or indirectly impact social or environmental aspect
	What are some of the challenges you faced in the preparation of ESMP for the year 2022	none
	Were you able to implement all ESS activities you planned in 2022, if no what were the reasons behind	Yes
	What level of support you received during the implementation <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - From the management - From other colleagues 	Full support
	How do you monitor the follow up of ESS activities Who is doing the site monitoring? Are reports sent to BFL PCU? How often? What details?	Concerned Range Officers are direct supervisor

	Any observations on the impact of ESS implementation on the - Environment - Community	
	Provide insights on any specific policies or guidelines that you follow to guide your work in implementing ESS	BFL ESS guideline and OHS Labour and Employment Act of Bhutan, 2007
Reporting	Is the ESS reporting procedure convenient to you? Any suggestions to improve it	Okay
Grievance reporting	In 2022, how many grievances received by the PAs/BCs	none
	How the PAs/BCs responded to the grievances	
	u. Who is the designated officer for receiving grievances? How does the mechanisms work? v. Was there any awareness on this conducted for local communities in your park/bc?	CFO
	Any observations on the level of satisfaction of the reporters	-
Conclusion	Is there any additional information or key points you would like to share regarding the implementation of ESS in your PAs/BCs	none

CFOs as the head of the management (PAs/BCs)

This interview question is to gather information on the ESS processes conducted in your PAs/BCs.

No	Interview questions	Responses
1	Name of PAs/BCs	Sakteng Wildlife Sanctuary
2	Respondents position	CFO
3	How long have you been in this PAs/BCs	4 years
4	What is your understanding on Environmental & Social Safeguards	Environmental and social safeguards is very important while carrying out the developmental activities, so that long term interest of both present and future generation is considered
5	Have you seen the ESMP 2022 for your park/bc? Where is it disclosed for easy access?	Yes It's in our SWS management website
6	How do you ensure the integration of ESS principles and practices in the overall management strategies of your PAs/BCs	It is always referred while carrying out any developmental activities within the Park
7	What is your involvement in the ESS implementation processes	Before starting any work and monitoring during the work and also after the work is done
8	What is the frequency of your interaction with the ESS focal on the update of ESS compliance	Very often as and when required
9	How do you monitor and evaluate the effectiveness of ESS measures in your PAs/BCs	Through the success of conservation and from interview with the communities
10	What are some of the key challenges or obstacles you have encountered in implementing ESS measures	Challenges not faced as of today
11	Is there any additional information or key points you would like to share regarding the implementation of ESS in your PAs/BCs	More education to staff as well as the communities on ESS
12	GRM a. Who is the designated officer for receiving grievances in your park/bc? How does the mechanisms work? b. Was there any awareness on this conducted for local communities in your park/bc?	I and Focal officer is nominated. As of today no grievances has come No

Interview question on implementation of Environmental & Social Safeguards management in the PAs, BCs and Others

ESS focal person

This interview question is to gather information on the ESS process conducted in your PAs/BCs. The confidentiality of the respondents will be protected.

Question category	Interview questions	Responses
General information	Name of PAs/BCs	Wangchuck Centennial National Park
	Respondents position	Dy. CFO
	How long have you been in this PAs/BCs	8 years
ESS capacity	Did you participate in ESS training and when	Yes,
	What is your understanding on Environmental & Social Safeguards	It serves as guide for the implementers to ensure safety
	Are you confident to manage ESS program in your PAs/BCs	Yes
	In-case you require additional capacity building in ESS, specify the area of requirement	- Planning - Reporting
ESS implementation	What are the activities funded under BFL in your park/bc that required an ESMP	Maintenance of staff quarter at Sephu and construction of river bank protection wall at Tandingang, Tang
	What are some of the challenges you faced in the preparation of ESMP for the year 2022	Quantification of resources to be used
	Were you able to implement all ESS activities you planned in 2022, if no what were the reasons behind	Yes
	What level of support you received during the implementation - From the management - From other colleagues	Strong support from management and field colleagues
	How do you monitor the follow up of ESS activities Who is doing the site monitoring? Are reports sent to BFL PCU? How often? What details?	Field visits and through reports from the field colleagues. Semi-annual reports were submitted as per the format developed by PCU.
	Any observations on the impact of ESS implementation on the - Environment - Community	No noticeable impacts were observed as of now as the activities implemented were of very small scale.

	Provide insights on any specific policies or guidelines that you follow to guide your work in implementing ESS	BFL suggested OHS standards and OHS standards of ministry of Labour and Human Resources
Reporting	Is the ESS reporting procedure convenient to you? Any suggestions to improve it	Yes
Grievance reporting	In 2022, how many grievances received by the PAs/BCs	No grievances so far
	How the PAs/BCs responded to the grievances	
	w. Who is the designated officer for receiving grievances? How does the mechanisms work? x. Was there any awareness on this conducted for local communities in your park/bc?	Nado primary and Tenzin secondary No
	Any observations on the level of satisfaction of the reporters	No reports of grievance
Conclusion	Is there any additional information or key points you would like to share regarding the implementation of ESS in your PAs/BCs	As the park has large area, we could not reach all the sites, so we had to rely on our field colleagues to monitor the activities.

CFOs as the head of the management (PAs/BCs)

This interview question is to gather information on the ESS processes conducted in your PAs/BCs.

No	Interview questions	Responses
1	Name of PAs/BCs	WCNP
2	Respondents position	CFO
3	How long have you been in this PAs/BCs	9 years
4	What is your understanding on Environmental & Social Safeguards	It is important component for the project document
5	Have you seen the ESMP 2022 for your park/bc? Where is it disclosed for easy access?	We implemented the ESMP as per the standard required Yes
6	How do you ensure the integration of ESS principles and practices in the overall management strategies of your PAs/BCs	We have in-cooperated some of the mitigation measures of the ESS guidelines into our new management plan.
7	What is your involvement in the ESS implementation processes	I am involved with implementation all mitigation measure required by the project guideline.
8	What is the frequency of your interaction with the ESS focal on the update of ESS compliance	As much as possible and whenever we need issue and problem to sloved.
9	How do you monitor and evaluate the effectiveness of ESS measures in your PAs/BCs	Field visit and report verification
10	What are some of the key challenges or obstacles you have encountered in implementing ESS measures	So far there was no challenges and issue faced
11	Is there any additional information or key points you would like to share regarding the implementation of ESS in your PAs/BCs	It should be made more simplified way
12	GRM a. Who is the designated officer for receiving grievances in your park/bc? How does the mechanisms work? b. Was there any awareness on this conducted for local communities in your park/bc?	Range officers are focal person at range level and DCFO and one senior officer is the focal officers at the park headquarter level. So far the implantation system is functioning smoothly. We conducted the awareness of it with local communities during the awareness program conducted on the use of online forestry services and amended FNCRR